



*Evaluation Report of Project
“Up gradation of Cabinet Division’s IT Infrastructure for
E-Governance”*



**GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN
PLANNING COMMISSION
PROJECT WING
(EVALUATION SECTION)
June 2017**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

S/No	Description	Page No.
	Executive Summary	3
1.	Introduction	4
-2.	The Project	5
3.	Justification of Project.....	6
4.	Project Objectives.....	7
5.	Scope of the Project	7
6.	Implementation and Revision of Project	11
7.	List of Project Directors.....	14
8.	Outcomes of Project	14
9.	Physical Achievements.....	15
10.	Project Achievements.....	16
11.	Manpower Requirements.....	18
12.	Financial Status.....	21
13.	Item Wise Expenditures	21
14.	Recurring Cost	23
15.	Impact of Project.....	24
16.	Analysis and Recommendations.....	25
17.	Composition of Evaluation team.....	27
18.	Photographs.....	28
19.	Annexure.....	32

Executive Summary

The Cabinet Division started the project named “Up-gradation of Cabinet Division’s IT Infrastructure for E-Governance” to improve the E-Readiness status of the Cabinet Division for utilization of E-Office application. The project was approved by DDWP on 15th July 2014 at an initial cost of Rs. 50.014 million and was later on revised on 09th June 2016 with revised cost of Rs. 54.014 million. The project was executed and supervised by Admin wing of the Cabinet Division. The project was proposed to create a computing environment for up gradation of IT infrastructure in Cabinet Division and to promote good governance in three basic ways: (a) by increasing transparency, information, and accountability; (b) by facilitating accurate decision-making and public participation; and (c) by enhancing the efficient delivery of public services.

All the physical targets have been achieved. Existing IT infrastructure has been strengthened. Establishment of a central helpdesk services for all the officers / officials of Cabinet Division which can be contacted in case of emergency. All the officers and officials of Cabinet Division are being equipped with latest procured IT equipment. Server Room has been upgraded and equipped with latest Fire Suppression system.

The project has significantly improved productivity, quality, resource management, turnaround time and increased transparency of government department by replacing the old manual (i.e. paper based file and paper based approval-process with an electronic file system. The project has drastically reduced paperwork by electronic movement of files to and from different sections of the Cabinet Division resulting in cost reduction and budget savings further more it has increased efficiency in administrative process of Cabinet Division.

Ministries/Divisions should have the capacity to execute their own projects by themselves for automation of their specific & customized requirements for which minimum IT manpower within Ministries/Divisions is required, The implementation of any IT project is not possible without professionally competent technical officers. Capacity of, IT employees of Ministries/Divisions should be developed through consistent relevant trainings to ensure the implementation of similar projects.

1. Introduction

E-Government is the use of information and communications technology to promote more efficient and cost effective government, facilitate more convenient government services, allow greater public access to information and make government more accountable to its citizens. The E-Government Directorate in Pakistan was established October 2002 created by the Ministry of Information Technology. The Federal Ministry of IT has been acutely aware of this growing reality and has included E-Government as a priority area in its first National IT Policy and Action Plan, approved by the Federal Cabinet in 2000. In the last few years, Ministry of IT and E-Government Directorate have undertaken multiple E-Government projects and currently have many in the pipeline, in this regard Cabinet Division implemented project “Up-gradation of Cabinet Division’s IT infrastructure for E-Governance”.

During the survey conducted by Ministry of IT & Telecom, it has been observed that Information and Communication Technology (ICT) infrastructure in Cabinet Division needs to be updated for the successful implementation of E-Office application. Over the last several decades, some of the more affluent and advanced countries have steadily been taking advantage of ICTs in various sectors of their society. This practice is due to some of the inherent advantages that ICTs have to offer i.e. speed, automation, reliability, transparency & accountability, predictability and lower the costs of operation

The project has significantly enhanced and strengthened/upgraded the current IT infrastructure and Implement Agency/ Specific customized software / E-Office application at all wings of Cabinet Division to improve internal communications and provide appropriate access to information on the working of Cabinet Division. In order to develop a Computing Facility capable of 24 X 7, it was necessary to identify and define the services to be provided by the IT Center, Cabinet Division. On identification of services, necessary hardware/ software infrastructure, manpower and corresponding performance levels were defined.

The project has considerably improved the E-Readiness status of All Wings/sections of the Cabinet Division for utilization of E-Office suite including e-filing system. All sections of Cabinet Division are getting excellent IT Support services for E-Governance and computing environment which improved efficient work performance for e-governance.

2. The Project

To enhance IT Infrastructure and to Implement E-filing system in Cabinet Division the Project “Up gradation of IT Infrastructure of Cabinet Division” was approved by DDWP (Annex-D) on 15th July 2014 at an initial cost of Rs. 50.014 million for three years and was later on revised for purchase of additional IT equipment on 09th June 2016 with revised cost of Rs. 54.014 million. Project execution period remains same i.e. three years, the Project has been executed by Admin wing of Cabinet Division. The project is to improve the e-readiness status of the Cabinet Division for utilization of E-Office suite including e-filing system. Under the project IT infrastructure and HR shall be strengthened to enable the Cabinet Division for utilization of this automated system (E-Office).

E-Office application comprising of following five modules, which were developed as pilot project at Ministry of Information Technology:

1. Internal Communication
2. Human Resource Management System
3. Inventory & Procurement Management System
4. Project Management System
5. Finance, Planning & Budgeting

First step towards E-Governance is to provide back-office (E-Office) in Cabinet Division. E-Governance is one of the core areas of importance recognized globally as a necessary means for good governance in the new Millennium. The Government of Pakistan (GoP) has been acutely aware of this growing reality and has included E-Government as a priority area in its first National IT Policy and Action Plan, approved by the Federal Cabinet in 2000. One key factor behind GoP's E-Government initiative is to build on solid foundations. This involves putting in place policies to ensure consistency in approach and a physical infrastructure that will support the needs of E-Governance for several years to come. The project was proposed to create a computing environment for Up gradation of IT infrastructure in Cabinet Division and promote good governance in three basic ways: (a) by increasing transparency, information, and accountability; (b) by facilitating accurate decision-making and public participation; and (c) by enhancing the efficient delivery of public services. Further the project will also provide latest tools and technologies for 24 x 7 IT operations.

3. Justification of Project

The server room at the Cabinet Division was established under the project titled "Federal Government Data Centre and Intranet", which was initiated by EGD/Ministry of IT & Telecom and approved by ECNEC in July 2004. The hardware procured under the project is either obsolete or damaged to an extent that the services provided by the server room can come to a grinding halt any time.

The following problems are faced during the operations from the server room.

- Obsolete Hardware.
- Expired / Obsolete Unlicensed Software.
- Unavailability of Hardware Requirement for Rollout of E-Office Suite.
- Lack of storage for active directory system.
- No facility for data backup.
- Inappropriate facility for air conditioning.
- Inappropriate environment for server room.
- Non availability for security appliances.
- Out-dated desktop computers of users.
- Non availability of IT service centre for dealing with in-house repairing of hardware/software issues.
- Non availability of Computer Training Lab.

To address these weak areas and to show commitment in approach need to strengthen the IT functions of the Cabinet Division for the smooth operations of E-Office. Hence a state of the Art computing facility is necessary that can provide 24 X 7 services. Provision of following basic ICT infrastructure for E-Office suit including e-Filing system, which includes the following:

- 1) Fibre Connectivity with E-Govt Data Centre.
- 2) Server Room up-gradation at Cabinet Division.
- 3) IT hardware and its up-gradation (Server, firewall, computers, laptops and scanners)
- 4) IT Human Resource.

4. Project Objective

The proposed project aims to enhance and strengthen/upgrade the current IT infrastructure and Implement Agency/ Specific customized software / E-Office applications at all wings of Cabinet Division which are of critical nature so as to improve internal communications and provide appropriate access to information on the working of Cabinet Division. In order to develop a Computing Facility capable of 24 X 7, it is necessary to identify and define the services to be provided by the IT Centre, Cabinet Division. On identification of services, necessary hardware / software infrastructure, manpower and corresponding performance levels have been defined. Based on the requirements and for the provision of smooth services mentioned above, revamping of Computing and Networking environment is required in the following areas:

- Hardware Infrastructure
- Software Infrastructure.
- Physical Layout and Security (Surveillance cameras, Fire suppression system, Access control system)
- Air-conditioning Requirements for Computer Training Lab and Server Room.
- Back Up Electricity Requirements.
- Air-conditioning Requirements for Computer Training.
- Manpower Requirements for IT Centre and Implementation of E-Office.

5. Scope of the Project

The main objective and scope of the project was to upgrade the IT infrastructure of Cabinet Division, which included the following initiatives:

- a. Recruitment
- b. Procurement
- c. Networking
- d. E-Office Implementation
- e. E-Office Trainings
- f. Software Development

a. Recruitment

The project was approved in July, 2014 and 09 IT professionals were hired in Feb, 2016, the reasons behind the delayed hiring of human resource are as follows:

- An objection was raised by Establishment Division with respect to Quota not defined in the published advertisement(**Annex- II**), during the 2nd year of project execution.

An advertisement was published on 22-10-2015 (**Annex-III**) for hiring of Senior Project Manager, Programmer, E-Office Implementer, Two Technical Assistants and Four Data Entry Operators, office orders of hired IT professionals are at (**Annex-IV**). Later on, two Data Entry Operators resigned and for new appointments advertisement was published again on 04-05-2016(**Annex-V**), Senior Project Manager also resigned on 13-08-2016 and for new appointment an advertisement was published on 07-08-2016(**Annex-V**) but post remains vacant because of non-availability of suitable candidate.

b. Procurement

All IT equipment were procured under the project in accordance with the release of funds by PSDP which are as follows:

Sr. No.	Items (as per PC-I)	Quantity
1	Servers	02
2	Data Rack with accessories	01
3	Rack Mounted UPS	01
4	Firewall	01
5	Computer	199
6	Laptops	20
7	Wireless Access Point	12
8	Heavy Duty Scanner	05
9	Standard Scanner	94
10	Active and Passive components for LAN	288
11	Network Printer	01
12	Operating System for Desktop / Laptop	219
13	Operating System for Servers	02
14	Antivirus	250
15	Air Conditioners	02
16	Access Control System	02
17	Vacuum Cleaner	01
18	Surveillance Camera	03
19	Digital Video Recorder	01
20	LED Screen 32 Inch	01
21	PC Repair Tool Kit	01
22	Automatic Fire Suppression System	01
23	Renovation of IT Center	01
24	Furniture for IT Center	58

Detailed information of distribution of Computer and scanners is at (**Annex-VI**) and Laptops is at (**Annex-VII**)

c. Networking

At the start of the project local area network was only available at 1st and 2nd floor of Cabinet Division. However, after the implementation of project the local area network was expanded to 3rd and 4th floor of the Cabinet Division. The expansion of local area network was completed in March, 2017, inspection report of LAN is at (**Annex-VIII**) which stands fully functional as of now.

d. E-Office Implementation

In order to implement E-Office application throughout Cabinet Division a comprehensive training program was developed and it was decided that E-Office application would be implemented wing wise. Regulatory Authority wing was the first wing to receive training and implement E-Office application. Subsequently further wings including Admin, Cabinet, Cabinet Committees, NTISB, Finance & Accounts, Organization, Implementation, National Documentation, Devolution and Development were trained and started using E-Office application. So far 270 employees have been trained and 630 files moved through E-Office.

Sr. No	Wing	Duration	Files Moved	No. of Files Moved to Officers				
				SO	DS	JS	AS	Secretary
1.	RA Wing	Apr 2016-June 2017	61	61	61	59	50	99*
2.	ADMN Wing	May 2016-June 2017	513	513	513	233	73	
3.	Cabinet Wing	July 2016-June 2017	30	30	30	19	14	
4.	Development Wing	Apr 2017- May 2017	3	3	3	-	-	
5.	NDW/Devolution Wing	Apr 2017-May 2017	5	5	3	2	-	
6.	Military/Awards Wing	Apr 2017-May 2017	3	3	1	1	-	
7.	CF&AO Wing	Apr 2017-Apr 2017	3	3	-	3	-	
8.	Organization Wing	Apr 2017-Apr 2017	2	2	2	2	-	

- Cabinet Committees and NTISB Wing have been trained, but they are not using E-Office application because of confidential data.
- National Documentation and Implementation wings were merged into Devolution wing.

* 90 files have been marked to Cabinet Secretary on E-Office, rest of the files were approved by concerned approving authority.

e. E-Office Trainings

Wings Trained for E-Office / Scanning					
Sr. No.	Wings	Officers	Officials	No of Trainings	
				E-Office	Scanning
1.	RA Wing	8	18	1	1
2.	NTISB Wing	4	11	2	1
3.	ADMN Wing	16	35	2	1
4.	Cabinet Wing	7	28	1	1
5.	Committee Wing	1	7	1	1
6.	NDW/Devolution Wing	10	16	1	1
7.	Implementation Wing	3	6	1	1
8.	Military/Awards Wing	2	8	1	1
9.	Development Wing	7	21	1	1
10.	Organization Wing	5	15	1	1
11.	CF&AO Wing	5	12	1	1
12.	Secretary Office	1	2	1	1
13.	Additional Secretary Offices	3	10	1	1
14.	IT Center	1	8	1	1
Total		73	197	16	14
Grand Total		270		30	

- a. Total No. of wings in Cabinet Division were Twelve
- b. All the wings have been trained on E-Office Application
- c. Out of twelve wings, National Documentation and Implementation wings were merged into Devolution wing.

f. Software Development

Software development was one of the essential needs of Cabinet Division, for which expertise of a programmer was required in order to design, maintain and upgrade official website of Cabinet Division on regular basis. In addition to the same, four different softwares have been developed on the request of head of the wings to automate work of wings. These softwares are as follows:

- i. Inventory management system
- ii. Automation of Pension Cases
- iii. Automation of Court Cases
- iv. Automation of Cabinet Meeting Agendas

6. Implementation and Revision of Project

The background of the project is that the PC-I titled "Up-gradation of Cabinet Division's IT Infrastructure for E-Governance" costing Rs.50.014 million was approved by Cabinet Division's DDWP on 07.07.2014. The project aims to upgrade the current IT infrastructure of Cabinet Division for implementation of E-Office application for E-Governance. As per requirements and for the provision of smooth services, revamping of Computing and Networking environment was required in the following areas:

- Hardware Infrastructure
- Software Infrastructure
- Physical Layout and Security
- Up - gradation of IT Centre for operational support.
- Training Lab and Server Room.
- Trained IT Manpower.

First year FY 2014-15, an allocation of Rs.10.00million was made. Out of which, Rs.9.8million were incurred on purchase of IT equipment for prioritized offices/wings i.e. RA Wing NTISB Wing and Admin Wing.

Second FY 2015-16, an allocation of Rs.40.014million was made. Out of which, Rs.24.390million were incurred on purchase of IT equipment and rest of the amount was surrendered and reallocated in the next financial year.

Third year FY 2016-17, an allocation of Rs.15.620 million was made and 4.764 million was additionally demanded in the revised PC-I. Out of which, Rs.19.824million were incurred on purchase of IT equipment, Up gradation of Local Area Network (LAN) installed at 1st and 2nd floor and its extension up to 3rd and 4th floor of Cabinet Block and renovation of IT Centre Room No.1038-E (2200 Sq.It).

Reasons of Revision

Sr.No.	Description of Work Plan	Reasons/Justification
1.	Up gradation of Local Area Network (LAN) installed at 1 st and 2 nd floor and its extension up to 3 rd and 4 th floor of Cabinet Block are located.	<p>The existing LAN was installed by M/o IT in 2004 only at 1st and 2nd floor of Cabinet Division which has Completed its life period. Due to its aging and available condition is weak link for the implementation of E-Office, for 199-users.</p> <p>Secondly, LAN connectivity was not earlier available at 3rd and 4th floor of Cabinet Block Where offices of Finance & Accounts, Organization and Development wings are located. Therefore, up gradation of LAN at 1st and 2nd floor and its extension up to 3rd and 4th floors is a basic requirement for e-filing system. Including these wings in the Cabinet division. Work Plan has been prepared on the basis of survey conducted by a private vendor and IT team.</p>
2.	Need for Computing Environment	<p>Room No.1038-E (2200 sq. It) Hall has been allocated for establishment of IT Centre. For Computing environment, the works of renovation, partitioning works for creation of Server Room, IT Lab for training, repair desk, store facility and seating arrangements for the newly recruited manpower are required to be arranged. Lay out plan of renovation work has been prepared for consideration of the DDWP. No additional funds are required and expenditure will be met from throw-forward fund.</p>
3.	Increase in quantity of Standard Scanners (light duty) from 64 to	<p>At the time of approval of PC-I, 64 scanners were approved keeping in view the requirement at that stage. However, it has transpired after experience of implementing E-Office in Cabinet Division that keeping in view the volume of work; it will not be</p>

		<p>possible share scanners. Therefore one scanner is proposed to be procured for each of the 97 offices/sections of the cabinet division.</p> <p>Secondly, the requirement of Development wing were not previously included in the PC-I. After its shifting into Cabinet Block, they are also in need of scanners therefore, 30 additional standard scanners (light duty) are required to meet the current need</p>
4.	20 x Laptops in place of 30 x Smart Phones	<p>30 Nos. smart phones costing Rs. 2.10 million were approved in the original PC-I. However there has been rethinking at the policy and strategic level, and it has been proposed that the smart phones may be replaced with laptops. Therefore, purchase of 20 Laptop is proposed within the allocated funds for Smartphone one.</p> <p>No additional funds are required; replacement will be made within allocated Rinds from throw-forward fund.</p>
5.	Funds for salaries of project staff and project management expense for FY-2016-17.	<p>No funds have been allocated to the IT Project for FY-2016-17 meet the expenditure on salary, allowances for project management and operating expense therefore, funds amounting to Rs. 4.0 million may be approved for FY-2016-17.</p>

7. List of Project Directors (PDs) till Completion

S.No.	Name & Designation	From	To
1	Mr. M Hassan Khan Niazi (JSAdmn)	July 2014	Dec 2016
2	Mr. Imran Ahmad (JSAdmn)	Jan 2017	March 2017
3	Mr.MuhammadAkram (JSAdmn)	March 2017	March 2017
4	Mr. Mahmood Hassan (Sr.JSAdmn)	March 2017	Till to Date

8. Outcomes of Project

- Strengthening of existing IT infrastructure for cabinet division.
- Deployment and establishment of 24 X 7 operations for computing environment.
- Establishment of a central helpdesk services contact for all the officers / officials of Cabinet Division which can be contacted in case of emergency.
- Linkages to the E-Office (Basic common application)
- Improved governance by implementation of E-governance.
- Increased Public sector capacity and more efficient service delivery.
- Easy access to information and data by officials
- Better enforcement of laws
- Increased efficiency of government business process.
- Enhanced capabilities of government employees in IT utilization.
- Timely disposal of cases
- Increased Productivity

9. Physical Achievements

- Recruitment of 01 Senior Project Manager, 01 E-Office implementer, 01 programmer, 04 data entry operators and 02 IT technicians.
- Purchase of IT equipment which includes computers, server, scanners, laptops, firewalls, antivirus, Operating System for Desktop / Laptop/Servers, Network Printer, Wireless Access Point, PC Repair Tool Kit and Data Rack with accessories
- Purchase of Surveillance Camera , Rack Mounted UPS , Air Conditioners, Digital Video Recorder, Vacuum Cleaner, Automatic Fire Suppression System
- Renovation and Furniture of IT Center
- All the inspection reports of procured IT equipment are at (**Annex-IX to Annex-XIV**)

Sr. No.	Establishment	Quantity (As per PC-I)	Actual * Achievements
1	Servers	02	02
2	Data Rack with Accessories	01	01
3	Rack Mounted UPS	01	01
4	Firewall	01	01
5	Computer	199	199
6	Laptops	20	20
7	Wireless Access Point	12	12
8	Heavy Duty Scanner	05	05
9	Standard Scanner	94	94
10	Active and Passive components for LAN	288	288
11	Network Printer	01	01
12	Operating System for Desktop / Laptop	219	219
13	Operating System for Servers	02	02
14	Antivirus	250	250
15	Air Conditioners	02	02
16	Access Control System	02	02
17	Vacuum Cleaner	01	01
18	Surveillance Camera	03	03
19	Digital Video Recorder	01	01
20	LED Screen 32 Inch	01	01
21	PC Repair Tool Kit	01	01
22	Automatic Fire Suppression System	01	01
23	Renovation of IT Center	01	01
24	Furniture for IT Center	58	58

10. Project Achievements

This project was for up-gradation of ICT hardware of Cabinet Division for implementation of Ministry of IT's "E-Office Application Suite". All the physical targets have been achieved. Essential ICT infrastructure for implementation of E-Office Application has been up-graded. New Servers, PCs, and laptops with licensed operating system and antivirus were procured. New Scanners were procured and provided at each section of Cabinet Division for scanning active and archive files. Server Room has been upgraded. A new Gigabit LAN with CAT-VI networking cable was installed at all first, second, third and four floors of Cabinet Division (Main). Thus more than decade old infrastructure has been replaced with new and efficient ICT infrastructure. Trainings on e-filing were imparted to all the officers and staff of Cabinet Division (Main) to implement Ministry of IT's E-Office application suite at all wings of Cabinet Division, additionally the achievements in following areas are as under:

a. Hardware Infrastructure

All the officers and officials of Cabinet Division are being equipped with latest Desktop PC's and Scanners, Laptops are provided to Senior Officers, Latest Servers in data rack are deployed in the newly created server room, and all internal and external traffic of LAN is protected by Firewall from external threads.

b. Software Infrastructure

The newly deployed servers are equipped with latest licensed operating system and licensed antivirus / anti-spam / Web Filter solution.

c. Physical Layout and Security

The newly created Server Room is equipped with latest Fire Suppression system in case of any incident of fire occurs, the facility is being separated from other area of IT Center by sealing it with concreted walls and iron door, access to facility is being restricted by installation of Access Control System and the facility is being monitored by latest Surveillance system.

d. Air-conditioning Requirements for Computer Training Lab and Server Room

One Air conditioner is installed in Server Room and One is Computer Training Lab

e. Backup Electricity Requirements

Latest UPS with additional battery banks are installed in the data racks of Server Room for Power Backup in case of Power failure in the IT Center to save the latest IT equipment from damage.

f. Local Area Network Upgradation& Extension.

Latest gigabit Local Area Network with all allied equipment's installed at 1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th floor and all the network is connected via latest technology using Fiber Optic using Layer 3 core switch.

g. Establishment of IT Centre for computing environment, IT Lab, Helpdesk & Server room etc.

A new IT center has been established which contains Main Server Room, IT Training Lab, 5 Officers Cabins and 3 staff cabins along with Furniture.

h. Manpower Requirements for IT Center and Implementation of E-Office.

Two Officers and Six officials were hired to implement the project that was administered by Joint Secretary (Admn) / Project Director, Deputy Secretary (Admn) / Senior Project Manager and Deputy Director (IT) for smooth implementation of the Project.

11. Manpower Requirements

Sr. No.	Designation/BPS	No. of Posts	Actual Recruitment	No of post recommended to be transferred to Non Development budget by department
1	Director IT BPS-19	01	01	01
2	Assistant Director IT BPS-17	01	01	01
3	ProgrammerBPS-17	01	01	01
4	Technical Assistant BPS-14	06	06	06

Workload

Director IT/Senior Project Manager

- Accountable for IT Centre results along with project sponsor(s).
- Complete work breakdown structure to estimate effort required for each task.
- Clearly communicate expectations to team members and stakeholders.
- Act as a mediator between stakeholders and team members.
- Resolve issues and solve problems throughout the operations of IT Centre.
- Prepares, maintains and submits clear & concise activity/progress reports and management reports.
- Manage multiple complex IT tasks/operations simultaneously.
- Communicates to all concerned parties project milestones, status updates, as well as any existing or potential user's escalation issues.
- Proactively follows escalation and change control processes.

Programmer

- Manage design and develop already build Cabinet Division's Website.
- Update daily contents of official website of Cabinet Division.
- Designs and develops new Softwares for Cabinet Division to improve the business process.
 - Inventory management system
 - Automation of Pension Cases
 - Automation of Court Cases
 - Automation of Cabinet Meeting Agendas

- Design and develop user guides for users.
- Conducts trainings of newly developed softwares to officers and officials of Cabinet Division.
- Manages Build server, Development Server, Application Server, DB Server etc.
- Also conducts trainings of existing softwares in Cabinet Division.

E-Office Implementer

- Conduct trainings of officers and officials of Cabinet Division on E-Office application.
- Conduct on desk training of newly posted or appointed officers of Cabinet Division.
- Conduct training of newly posted or appointed officials of Cabinet Division in IT Center's Lab.
- Handles/resolves E-Office and IT complaints/queries of senior officials of Cabinet Division.
- Provides on demand trainings to officials on Microsoft applications, third party software's application.
- Develops E-Office training materials in shape of presentations and handouts.
- Development of knowledge assessment (written tests) checks, qualification cards, and feedback forms to determine if training was beneficial.
- Monitors and evaluates the progress of trainees.
- Maintains professional and technical knowledge by attending workshops; reviewing professional publications and establishing personal networks.
- Confirms program operation by conducting tests; provide suggestions to Ministry of IT for modifying different features of E-Offices.
- Updates training material (**Annex-XV**) to meet new training requirements and to keep technical information up to date.
- Maintains Individual and group training records.
- Provides performance improvement feedbacks to the Cabinet Division and Ministry of IT project implementation team.
- Coordinates with Cabinet Division and PCB for E-Office deployment.
- Efficient/effective Implementation of E-Office in the Cabinet Division.
- Provides training, guidance and support to Data Entry Operators on an ongoing basis.

IT Technician/Data Entry Operator

- Provides Complete IT Support throughout the Cabinet Division, which includes
 - Configurations of PCs/Laptops/Printers/Scanners/Antivirus/Servers/Core switches
 - Troubleshoots of PCs/Laptops/Printers/Scanners/Antivirus/Servers/Core switches
 - Installation of all the required application softwares and systems softwares
 - Provide support to NTC ADSL modem and routers.
 - Troubleshoots internet and intranet connectivity
 - Provides on desk training of scanners and application softwares
 - Printer sharing and Drive Mapping
- Provides Complete IT Support at IT Center of Cabinet Division, which includes
 - Manages Servers and Switches
 - Manages firewall and antivirus
 - Handles surveillance system
 - Handles Bio Metric attendance and management system
- Provides in house maintenance of PCs/Laptops/Printers/Scanners, which includes
 - Installation of operating systems
 - Installation of printers/scanners drivers
 - Configuration and troubleshooting of Bio Metric Machines
 - Configuration and troubleshooting of surveillance system
- Provides IT Support for internal meeting of Cabinet Division
 - Handles video conferencing equipment
 - Handles Multimedia/Speakers/Microphones
 - Handles other technical equipment
- Provides IT Supports on Mega Events including
 - Independence Day.
 - 23rd March Pakistan Day.
 - Award Ceremonies.
- Provides on desk training of E-Office/scanning to officers/officials of Cabinet Divisions.
- Provides other IT Support to officers/official use, which includes
 - On demand making of Ethernet/LAN Cables.
 - Maintenance of Mac Systems, I-Pads, Tablets, smart phones.
 - Scanning and maintenance of corrupt USBs.
- Confer with users to establish requirements for new systems, installations or modifications.

12. Financial Status

Year	PC-I Phasing		PSDP Allocation		Releases		Expenditure*	
	Total	FEC	Total	FEC	Total	FEC	Total	FEC
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
2014-15	9.795	NIL	10.000	NIL	10.000	NIL	9.800	NIL
2015-16	24.592	-	40.014	-	40.014	-	24.390	-
2016-17	19.625	-	15.620	-	15.620	-	19.824**	-
Total	54.014						54.014	

- Budget reconcile statement is at (**Annex-XVI**)
- As per PC-I the initial cost of the project was 50.014 million and was later revised with the cost of 54.014 million.
- 4.764 million additionally demanded in the revised PC-I and released in the fourth quarter of FY 2016-17

*Estimated Cost in millions

** An Amount of 15.620 million was PSDP allocation, but an estimated expenditure of amount 19.824 million incurred which includes an amount of 4.764 million demanded in revised PC-I

13. Item Wise Expenditures

Sr. No.	Item / Descriptions	Unit Price (Rs.)	Quantity	Total Price (Rs.)
1	Server: Latest Rack Servers Dell Power Edge R930	1,701,300	02	3,402,600
2	Server Data Rack: Toten – KD.6837.9001	302,682	01	302,682
3	Rack Mounted UPS: Delta RT-6K Model 6KVA/5.4KW	226,000	01	226,000
4	Firewall: WatchGuard Model Firebox M200	438,311	01	438,311
5	Desktop Computer: (i) Dell OptiPlex 9020 (ii) Dell OptiPlex 7020 (iii) Dell OptiPlex 5040	96,500.43 88,992 84,316	28 46 125	2,702,012.04 40,93,632 10,539,500
6	Laptops: Dell Inspiron 5559	138,000	20	2,760,000
7	Wireless Access Point Engenius EWS 320 AP	44,786	12	537,432

8	Heavy Duty Scanner: Kodaki2600 Kodak i2600	158,999.49 125,000	02 03	317,999.97 375,000
9	Standard Scanner: Kodak – i1150 Canon DR-F120 Kodak – i1150 AvisionAD230	61,240 68,000.4 64,500 48,555	23 08 33 30	1,408,520 544,003.2 2,128,500 1,456,650
10	Operating System for Desktops and Laptops: Licensed Microsoft Windows 8.1 Professional (64bit) with media kit	15,862 15,194 14,976	46 153 20	729,652 2,324,682 299,520
11	Server Operating System: Microsoft Windows 2012 Servers Standard OEM	84,776	02	169,552
12	Antivirus: Kaspersky Endpoint Security (Version Business-SELECT)	2,720.248	250	680,062
13	Air Conditioners: Orient Split Air Conditioner 2 Ton	108,810	02	217,620
14	Access Control: Zkteco F-18	60,786	02	121,572
15	Vacuum Cleaner Samsung 2.4 Ltr Model SC-5450	11,500	1	11,500
16	Surveillance Camera HIKVISIONHD16C2T	15,786	03	47,358
17	Digital Video Recorder (DVD) Hik Vision Model : 7116, Hard Disk: 2 TB Sata Seagate	48,786	01	48,786
18	Samsung LED Screen32 Inch 32LN4900	28,080	01	28,080
19	PC Repair Tool Kit	58,500	01	58,500
20	Multipurpose Network Printer HP LaserJet Pro MFP M277n	68,000	01	68,000
21	Layer 2 Switch 24 Ports: Extreme Summit Model X430-24t	242,253	02	484,506
22	Layer 2 Switch 48 Ports: Extreme Summit Model X430-48t	332,210	08	2,657,680
23	Layer 3 Core Switch 24 Ports: Extreme Summit Model X460-24t	1,724,168	01	1,724,168
24	Passive Work: 3M CAT 6 Cable, Patch Panel, CAT6 I/O, Faceplate, Patch Cord, Fiber Backbone Cable, Optical Distribution Frame, Adamjee Dura Duct	10,250	288	2,952,000
25	Switch Cabinet 15U: Toten	27,285	06	163,710
26	Automatic Fire Suppression System with installation: FM200 GAS, FM-200 Cylinder, Manual	594,753	01	594,753

	Actuator, Discharge Nozzle, Caution Sign, Single Area Extinguishing Panel, Optical Smoke Detector, Electric Sounder Siren, Fire Alarm Bell 06”, HCFC Blend B-Clean Agent			
27	Furniture Computer Chairs for IT Lab Computer Chairs for Staff Computer table executive with top glass, front cover, four legs removable. Revolving Chairs for officers Side Rack for Computer File Rack Shelf wooden and glass door (two shelf with glass door and lock) Visitor chairs.	5,800 5,800 14,000 11,500 5,000 18,000 5,500	20. Nos 08 Nos. 05 Nos. 05 Nos 05 Nos. 05 Nos. 10 Nos.	116,000 46,400 70,000 57,500 25,000 90,000 55,000 Total: 459,900
28	Renovation for IT Center Partitioning work of glass & aluminum fitting in Hall No 1038-E	1,300,000	2200 Sq.ft.	1,300,000

14. Recurring Cost

Finance Division may be requested for allocation of regular budget of Rs. 13.986 million for FY 2017-18.

(Rs. Millions)

Sr. No	Components	PC-I Estimates	Actual Expenditure
1	Establishment (09)	NIL	6.936
2	Repair & Maintenance	NIL	1.000
3	Operating Cost	NIL	6.050
	Total		13.986

Establishment

01 Director IT, Assistant Director IT, Programmer and 06 Technical Assistants

Repair/Maintenance

All the IT equipment procured under this project is in three years warranty, License Renewal of Antivirus after 2018-19

Operating

Next Generation Firewall, Core Switch, licenses for protection from malwares, Network Management system, ransom attacks and advance persistent threats (APT).

15. Impact of Project

The project has significantly improved productivity, quality, resource management, turnaround time and increased transparency of government department by replacing the old manual (i.e. paper based file and paper based approval-process with an electronic file system. The project has drastically reduced paperwork by electronic movement of files to and from different sections of the Cabinet Division resulting in cost reduction and budget savings furthermore it has increased efficiency in administrative process of Cabinet Division. Through paperless office, it is much easier to get hold of documents and the chances of losing, misplacing the documents that contain confidential information are rarely possible. With the procurement of latest and reliable hardware and software systems for the project, IT infrastructure of the Cabinet Division stands totally revamped. The system is capable of Storing and protecting large amount of official information/files in an organized, reliable and confidential manner. The project has paved a platform for personalized, role based, secure access to internal information for the employees that is accessible through any browser. Personalized services are enabled and employees receive electronic notifications of services and transactions based on their needs and contingencies.

16. Analysis and Observations

i. The project was approved by DDWP on 15th July 2014 at an initial cost of Rs. 50.014 million for period of three years (2014-2017) and was later on revised on 09th June 2016 with revised cost of Rs. 54.014 million with the same implementation period. The project will complete in June 2017 at cost of Rs. 54.014 million. The main reasons of revision were to upgrade the old network equipment and to expand networking to 3rd and 4th floor of Cabinet Division. Moreover renovation/partition of IT room beside extra procurement of scanner/laptops. 30 smart phone was removed from original PC-I and 20 laptop included in PC-I.

ii. The project authorities have developed four softwares on demand of different sections for their simplicity of work. However, it was observed that only one software i.e Automation of pension Cases was properly functional and the remaining software i.e automation of court cases, cabinet meeting agenda and inventory management software were still in testing phase.

iii. As per project document, the project's manpower was to be hired in first year of the project, however, the authorities failed to hire, whatever reasons, in the first year of the project despite of fund releases i.e 10 million against the 9.795 million. This delay in hiring adversely affected the project impact like development of different software and execution of project activities to achieve project objectives.

iv. It has been observed that due to technical support and training by the project employees, the Division is now able to move 50% files through e-office, which definitely improved its efficiency. However, much more efforts are required by IT Section for 100% file moment through e-office.

v. One of main purpose of this project is to implement "E-office Application Suit" of MoIT. The said software comprising of following modules

- i. Internal Communication,
- ii. HRM System
- iii. Inventory and Procurement System
- iv. Project Management System,
- v. Finance Planning and Budgeting,
- vi. Internal portal.

Currently only one module i.e Internal Communication is functional in Cabinet Division. The paperless environment will only possible, in Cabinet Division, if all the above modules become functional which will improve efficiency and overall performance.

vi. It was observed during visit that renovation and partitions for offices in IT hall was still in process. The main reason of delay was due to fixation of tiles by CDA. It was ensured by the project authorities that renovation and partition work would be completed by June 2017.

vii. In 2015-16, Planning Commission allocated and released an amount of Rs.40.014 million against the PC-I phasing of Rs.24.592 million to complete the project before time. However, the project authorities only utilized Rs.24.390 million and surrendered remaining amount Rs 15.624 million.

viii. A high turnover of Project Director was observed during implementation of the project. As many as 4 project directors on additional charge were changed during the span of project life. This high turnover hampered the project activities. Giving additional charge, as Project Director is not a good practice for successful project implementation. This resulted into poor implementation of the project especially in the recruitment/procurement process.

ix. It has been informed that the project was not externally monitored during its execution to track its implementation and outputs systematically and measure the effectiveness.

x. The project has successfully networked all four floors of cabinet division. This networking is further improve by following measure, suggested by NTISB

- a. Installation of next generation firewall for dual network
- b. Installation of layer 3 core switch for physical separation of dual network
- c. Server based malware intrusion and deduction system
- d. Network monitoring system for all installed switches and equipment

17. Recommendations

- i. The Cabinet Division may take measures to functional remaining software internally prepared as soon as possible. These software includes
 - a. Automation of court cases,
 - b. Cabinet meeting agenda
 - c. Inventory management software

It is also propose that all the section of cabinet division may approach IT Section for any automation/software to simplify their work.

- ii. To further strengthen the networking security and network monitoring, following measure as advised by NTISB may be undertaken by cabinet Division by their own budget
 - a. Installation of next generation firewall for dual network
 - b. Installation of layer 3 core switch for physical separation of dual network
 - c. Server based malware intrusion and deduction system
 - d. Network monitoring system for all installed switches and equipment
 - e. Network Administrator post may also be added to the IT Section for network operations.
- iii. The executing agency may ensure the completion of renovation/partition work in IT hall by June 2017 so that IT activities be operationalized in a comfortable environment.
- iv. The project activities are of regular nature and to sustain the investment made, it is therefore, recommended that the project activities may be transferred to non-development side beside the following posts:

Sr. No	Designation/BPS	No. of Posts
1	Director IT (BPS-19)	01
2	Assistant Director IT (BPS-17)	01
3	Programmer (BPS-17)	01
4	Technical Assistant (BPS-14)	06
Total		9

- v. Cabinet Division may approach MoIT to implement the remaining modules of “E-office Application Suit” immediately so that all the application is executed in true letter & spirit.
- vi. Some of Sections of Cabinet Division do not use e-Office due to security concern over the networking. The Cabinet Division should take the matter with MoIT to solve this issue on

priority basis.

- vii. It is also recommended that the projects activities are of regular nature, it may be transferred along with incumbents to non-development side to avoid project employee's brain drain and continuation of project activities seamlessly.
- viii. The project must be monitored internally by sponsoring agencies and externally by Planning Commission so that flaws in execution of project may be removed/rectified timely during its implementation.
- ix. Frequent changes of Project Director hinder the smooth implementation of the project. It is, therefore, recommended that frequent change/transfer of Project Director may be avoided in future for smooth implementation of project activities. It is also recommended that an independent Project Director should be appointed to execute the project efficiently to avoid cost overrun.

Composition of Evaluation Team for Evaluation

1. Engr. Amir Zamir Ahmed Khan
Director General (Evaluation)
Projects Wing
Planning, Development and Reform Division

2. Mr. Sajjad Jan Khattak,
Deputy Director (E)
Projects Wing
Planning, Development and Reform Division

3. Arshad Khalid
Network Administrator
MIS Section, Projects Wing
Planning, Development and Reform Division